**Was ist Wahrheit?** Instituts für Design Science, Universität Halle-Wittenberg, 27-29 September 2019

WAHRHEIT ODER WAHRHEITSLIEBE IN UNSERER ABBILDUNG VON WIRKLICHKEIT?



udima

Design

José María Díaz Nafría

## The Problems of Achieving and Speaking the Truth



*Time Saving Truth from Falsehood and Envy.* François **Lemoyne**, 1737

"... a **general criterion** of truth must be such as would be valid in each and every instance of knowledge, however their objects may vary. It is obvious however that such a criterion [being general] cannot take account of the [varying] content of knowledge (relation to its [specific] object). But ... **truth concerns** just this very **content** ...."

Critique of the Pure Reason, Inmanuel Kant

"Truth is the property of no individual but is the treasure of all men." Ralph Waldo Emerson.

"In a time of universal deceit speaking the truth is a revolutionary act."

Attributed to George Orwell.

# The problem of truth in the context of multiple perspectives of reality



#### Contents

- 1. The problem of truth (Wittenberg, 2018)
- 2. How do we know the truth?
- 3. How do we speak the truth?
- 4. How is our system of truths?
- 5. How in the hell can we integrate everyone truths?
  - How it is done in the current digital world
  - How can we do otherwise?
- 6. The glossaLAB project



# 1. The problem of truth

What is **truth** in the first place?

Classical approach: A is B : Judgment  $T \lor \neg T$ ?

## A object of observation,

A encapsulates:  $\{A_1, A_2...\}$ A<sub>1</sub> encapsulates:  $\{A_{11}, A_{12}...\}$ etc

 $\{A_1 \ldots A_j\}$  we have observation access to  $\{A_{j+1} \ldots A_N\}$  we have no observational access to

### **B** predicament, attribute,

B encapsulates: {B<sub>1</sub>, B<sub>2</sub>...} B<sub>1</sub> encapsulates: {B<sub>11</sub>, B<sub>12</sub>...} etc

 $\{B_1..., B_j\}$  is conscious  $\{B_{j+1}..., B_N\}$  is unconscious



## **Contending perspectives:**

- Correspondence: "Verita est adequatio rei et intellectus" (Aquinas). Logic Inductivism.
- Coherence: fit of elements within a whole system
- Constuctivist: social processes...
- Consensus
- Pragmatic theories: concepts into practice.
- *Deflationary*: expressive convenience.



#### Bekenstein Holographic Universe







How do we achieve these models / proxies?

**K** (*object*) = min {Length(*algorithm*  $\rightarrow$  *object*)}

"Diese Mosaik von Worten, wo jedes Wort als Klang, als Ort, als Begriff, nach rechts und links und über das Ganze hin seine Kraft ausströmt, dieses Minimum im Umfang und Zahl der Zeichen, dieses damit erzielte Maximum in der Energie der Zeichen"

Über Oden der Horaz, Nietzsche

# 3. How do we speak the truth (truthfulness)?

(o1) *Intensiveness* (more essential description)



Openness of the conceptualisation triangle:

- o1) intensiveness: we can achieve a more essential description
- o2) object-extensiveness: we can add more details
- o3) world-extensiveness: we refer to more reality

# 3. How do we speak the truth?

• Beyond deduction and induction: abduction (emergence of concepts)



TRUTH OR TRUTHFULNESS IN OUR MAPPING OF REALITY?

## 4. How is our system of truths / knowledge?

The Modal Stratified Bond Model (Burgin, Díaz) distinguish:

- 1) Modal dimension (horizontal)
  - Assertoric knowledge
  - *Hypothetic* or *heuristic* knowledge (possible knowledge)
  - *Erotetic* knowledge (knowledge deficit)
- 2) Hierarchical dimension (vertical)
  - Componential level: elements, parts, blocks used to build  $\rightarrow$
  - *Attributed* level reflects the static structure
  - Productive level reflects the cognitive (dynamic) structure of K (acquisition, production and transmission)
- 3) Systemic dimension
  - *Descriptive* K: about **properties** and **relations** of the objects of knowledge
  - *Representational* K: set of representations of an object (models, images..)
  - Operational K: rules, procedures, algorithms, etc., for practical purposes.

## 4. Structural perspective of knowledge Integration

## **Conceptualisation** of knowledge:

- Mapping c of a knowledge structure **K** into a conceptual system **C**:  $\mathbf{K} \rightarrow \mathbf{C}$
- Named set (K, c, C): conceptualisation of K by C

### **Knowledge integration**

When knowledge from different systems is mapped into one conceptual system it is called *conceptual knowledge integration*.

### **Conceptual system**

consists of **concepts** and **relations** between them: **concept network** 

It contains: Systemic (or primary) concepts: K items with descriptions

*Emphasized* (or *secondary*) *concepts:* used in descriptions of systemic concepts and have descriptions

*Background* (or *tertiary*) *concepts:* used in descriptions, without descriptions

## 4. Structural perspective of knowledge Integration

### **Representation model:**



### The Conceptual representative of a concept:

- 1) The Concept Domain  $(D_c)$ : domain of reality described
- 2) Broad-spectrum concept knowledge (BK): what is known about the D<sub>C</sub>
- 3) Representation: embraces different representations about the  $D_C$

The meaning of a concept is formed by its description in the conceptual system:



## 4. Structural perspective of knowledge Integration

### **Conceptual integration**



Can we really achieve it?

### Nominalization named set (CN, r, NN)



We can explore them in disciplinary settings

## 4. Network Perspective of Knowledge



(Passive) Conceptual Network

(Active) Network of *cognitive agents* 

Each concept enables that a knowledge domain can better approach a specific part of the reality referred (or provides an operational capacity to the other concepts in such endeavor)

# 5.1 How do we speak the truth in the digital world?

## **Filter Bubbles**

The EU referendum debate in the UK Mapping polarization on social media

Semantic network analysis of 13,310 co-occurring hashtags on Instagram related to the UK's EU referendum debate



Clinton and Trump supporters live in their own Twitter worlds

Follow only Trump Follow only Clinton Follow both Follow neither

This large cluster of Trump supporters on Twitter have little mutual follower overlap with other users and are a remarkably cohesive group. They exist in their own information bubble.

# 5.1 How do we speak the truth in the digital world?

2) **Discourse dynamics in the left-wing coalition**: Study of Twitter interaction during the Spanish electoral campaign for 2016 general elections



TRUTH OR TRUTHFULNESS IN OUR MAPPING OF REALITY?

# 5.1 How do we speak the truth in the digital world?

## **Big-Data** approach

- What are the interest, context, abstraction behind?
- Where are the peoples? •



TRUTH OR TRUTHFULNESS IN OUR MAPPING OF REALITY?

# 5.2 How can we integrate knowledge otherwise?

### How can we do otherwise?

**Descentralised** conceptualisation, awareness (CLP)



# 5.2 How can we integrate knowledge otherwise?



## Enhanced methodology (Encyclopaedic project)





TRUTH OR TRUTHFULNESS IN OUR MAPPING OF REALITY?

## Enhanced methodology (glossaLAB project)

#### Assessing the Performance of Knowledge Integration

In order to qualify the knowledge integration achieved in a given research framework, the ID-glossaries, used to elucidate the network of concepts, will serve as a proxy of such integration. To that purpose each contribution and participant will be identified by the knowledge domains involved using a set of 67 domains adapted from the higher categories of the Universal Decimal Classification. Such identification allows assessing the integration through a multidimensional perspective based on:

- the diversity of the disciplines involved, measured in terms of Shannon Diversity Index, and
- The effective integration achieved through the meeting of different perspectives, measured through the analysis of both the *semantic network* of elucidated concepts and the *network* of participant researchers (in terms of average minimal distance between any two nodes and the clustering coefficient). Both values can be combined using the *small-coefficient*,  $\sigma$ , or other alternatives.<sup>1</sup>

- Technical level: desarrollo de plataformas abiertas
- Theoretical Level: ID contributions
   + Discussion + Integration (Intensiveness performance)
- Meta-theoretical level: KI performace assessment
- Organisational level: structure and management system based on the Viable System Model

## **Co-organising congresses** linked to glossaLAB



TRUTH OR TRUTHFULNESS IN OUR MAPPING OF REALITY?

# Danke für Ihre Aufmerksamkeit

INSTITUT FÜR Design Science

WAHRHEIT ODER WAHRHEITSLIEBE IN UNSERER ABBILDUNG VON WIRKLICHKEIT?

> José María Díaz Nafría jdian@unileon.es http://bitrum.unileon.es



**BITrum** Universidad de León





## Approach for advancing and assessing KI (glossariumBITri)

#### Aims:

- Theoretically level
- Metatheoretically
   level

Methodology to assess knowledge integration



#### The problem of truth in the context of multiple perspectives of reality

## Approach for assessing KI (glossariumBITri results)



The problem of truth in the context of multiple perspectives of reality

1

### Approach for assessing KI (glossariumBITri results)



## **Thecnical** level: platform development

Article       Discussion       Read       Edit       View history       Search         Voice (e.g., Feedback)       Author name (Year), e-International Encyclopaedia of Systems and Cybernetics, 1(1)       Publication record         Author name (Year), e-International Encyclopaedia of Systems and Cybernetics, 1(1)       Curator: Name 1       Curator: Name 1         General description summarizing the content of the article       Publication tecord       Curator: Name 1         DEF. 1       P.       Result of a theoretical depuration process       Previous versions: date 2; date 3          Applications related to the concept       Post-publication: Name 4   date         Perspectives       Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)         Content from <i>Principia Cybernetica</i> (acknowledging authorship)       New content         References       Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3       Online resources			<u>A</u> あ Engl	ish 💄 Name Tal	k Preferences W	atchlist Contributions Log	
Voice (e.g., Feedback)       Publication record         Author name (Year), e-International Encyclopaedia of Systems and Cybernetics, 1(1)       Curator: Name 1         General description summarizing the content of the article       Publication record         DEF. 1       DEF. 2       Result of a theoretical depuration process       Publication record          Applications related to the concept       Post-publication: Name 4   date         Perspectives       Name 5   date         Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)       Content from <i>Principia Cybernetica</i> (acknowledging authorship)         Content from glossariumBITri (idem)       New content         References       Online resources          Online resources	Article	Discussion	Read	Edit	View history	Search C	
Author name (Year), e-International Encyclopaedia of Systems and Cybernetics, 1(1)       Curator: Name 1         General description summarizing the content of the article       Name 2, Name 1         DEF. 1       Perspectives         Applications related to the concept       Post-publication: Name 5   date         Perspectives       Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)         Content from glossariumBITri (idem)       New content         References       Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3	<b>Voice</b> (e.g., Feedback)					Publication record	
General description summarizing the content of the article       Contributors: Name 2, Name 1         DEF. 1 DEF. 2 Result of a theoretical depuration process       Previous versions: date 2; date 3         Applications related to the concept       Post-publication: Name 4   date Name 5   date         Perspectives       Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)         Content from <i>Principia Cybernetica</i> (acknowledging authorship)       New content         Content from glossariumBITri (idem)       New content         References       Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3       Description	Author na	Author name (Year), e-International Encyclopaedia of Systems and Cybernetics, 1(1)					
DEF. 1 DEF. 2  Applications related to the concept       Previous versions: date 2; date 3         Perspectives       Post-publication: Name 4   date Name 5   date         Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)       Content from Principia Cybernetica (acknowledging authorship)         Content from glossariumBITri (idem)       New content         References       Online resources	General	General description summarizing the content of the article					
DEF. 1 DEF. 2  Applications related to the concept       Previous versions: date 2; date 3         Post-publication: Name 4   date Name 5   date         Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)         Content from Principia Cybernetica (acknowledging authorship)         Content from glossariumBITri (idem)         References         Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3		~				Publication date: Date 1	
Applications related to the concept       Post-publication:         Name 4   date       Name 5   date         Perspectives       Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)         Content from Principia Cybernetica (acknowledging authorship)       Content from glossariumBITri (idem)         References       Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3       Date of the concept	DEF. 1 DEF. 2	<ul> <li>Result of a theoretical depura</li> </ul>	ation process			Previous versions: date 2; date 3	
Perspectives       Name 5   date         Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)       Content from Principia Cybernetica (acknowledging authorship)         Content from glossariumBITri (idem)       New content         References       Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3       Description of the principia of the princia of the principia of the principia of the	 Applica	<b>Post-publication</b> : Name 4   date					
Content from François' IESC (particularly, referring the definitions provided by other authors)         Content from Principia Cybernetica (acknowledging authorship)         Content from glossariumBITri (idem)         References         Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3	Perspe	ectives				Name 5   date	
Content from glossariumBITri (idem)       New content         References       Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3       Online resources	Content	t from François' <i>IESC</i> (particularly, 	referring the o	definitions p 	rovided by o	ther authors)	
Content from glossariumBITri (idem)       New content         References       Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3							
References       Online resources         Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3       Online resources	Conten	t from <i>glossariumBITri</i> (idem)	Ν	lew content			
Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3	Refere	References		Online resources			
Category: cat_1, cat_2, cat_3							
	Catego	r <b>y</b> : cat_1, cat_2, cat_3					

- Co-edition platform (MediaWiki)
- Peer-review publication system
- Semantic Annotation
- Semantic navigation
- Semantic network visualisation
- Semantic networks analysis